

One method of performance evaluation is to review operating statistics for similar transit programs. Studying other CTSA's and Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) programs can provide ideas for new programs and practices. Table 15 presents operating and performance statistics for other Non-Emergency Medical Transportation Programs and CTSA's:

- **El Dorado County Sac-Med** – Next door to Placer County, El Dorado County operates a non-emergency medical transportation service two days per week. The service provides transportation to medical appointments in Sacramento and Roseville made between 10:00 AM and 2:00 PM. Rides must be scheduled at least four days in advance. Passengers can be picked up at one of six Park and Ride or transit centers or request El Dorado County DAR to one of these locations. The Sac-Med service carried only 572 trips in FY 2016-17, but the service operates only two days per week and only to Sacramento and Roseville. Hence, passenger-trips per capita is only 0.003, less than Health Express. However, data in Table 11 shows that there were 14 one-way trips to/from Sacramento for one month on Health Express. This would equate to roughly 170 trips to/from Sacramento annually on Health Express, which is much less than the Sac-Med service.



- **North of the River CTSA Bakersfield** – The North of the River Recreation and Parks District is a designated CTSA for Kern County. The district provides transportation for seniors 60+ and persons with disabilities to doctor appointments, senior activities, grocery shopping and other essential trips Monday through Friday for \$2.00 per one-way trip. The service area boundary is a defined area in the City of Bakersfield and qualified passengers can reserve trips between the hours of 8:00 AM and 5:30 PM.



The CTSA carried 42,217 trips in calendar year 2017. This equates to a productivity level of about 1.87 trips per hour and 0.115 trips per capita.

- **Ride-On Transportation Program (San Luis Obispo County)** – Ride-On is a non-profit organization dedicated to meeting the varied transportation needs of San Luis Obispo County residents. As a designated CTSA for the county, Ride-On receives \$500,000 in LTF funding from the San Luis Obispo Council of Governments (SLOCOG). Ride-on has a much larger variety of transportation programs available.
  - The Senior Shuttle operates Monday through Friday from 9 AM to 5 PM at a cost of \$3.00 per one-way trip to locations throughout the county. Advance reservations are requested.



- The Veterans Express Shuttle provides transportation to local Veterans Administration (VA) clinics and VA bus pick up locations for regional medical facilities for \$3.00 per one-way trip with advance reservations. Ride-On also provide homeless veterans transportation to a facility where they can take a shower one day per week.
- Ride-On also administers and provides a vehicle for an Agricultural Workers Vanpool.
- Ride-On is a state approved Medi-Cal transportation provider for persons who are unable to use public transit. Much of Ride-On’s funding comes from Medi-Cal.
- The largest program with Ride-On operates is transportation for clients of the Regional Center to day programs. Ride-On operates 34 routes for just this program.
- In addition to this, Ride-On offers transportation for developmentally disabled residents in the evening and weekends through the Community Interaction Program.
- In response to a finding in the coordinated plan, Ride-On began a new program called Access which provides transportation for people who do not fit into the other program categories but are considered low income.

In the future, Ride-on hopes to establish a transportation brokerage which would allow Ride-On to notify other transportation companies such as taxi companies when Ride-On is unable to meet a ride request.

The agency has an administrative staff of about 9 people, 4 dispatchers and 48 drivers. Ride-On provides all vehicle maintenance on-site with three full-time mechanics. Although San Luis Obispo County has a smaller population than Placer County, the Ride-on CTSA provides around 174,000 one-way trips per year on all the above listed community transportation programs. This is significantly more than Health Express and My Rides combined. The costs of the program are also significantly greater (\$4 – 5 million) and Ride-On operates nearly 2 million vehicle miles per year. The majority of the funding for Ride-On services comes from other outside programs such as the Regional Center and Medi-Cal. In terms of productivity, the Ride-On programs carry 2.7 trips per hour, 0.9 trips per mile and 0.62 trips per capita.

In addition to the community transportation programs, Ride-on provides transportation as a private operator for events through the Transportation Management Association. This program also provides some income for the Ride-On agency.

The peer comparison in Table 15 should take into account that CTSA and NEMT programs can vary greatly. Nevertheless, Table 15 demonstrates that for counties/cities of similar size (San Luis Obispo and Bakersfield), WPCTSA provides fewer trips per capita (0.037). Passenger–trips per hour for the Health Express program is also less than the programs in San Luis Obispo and Bakersfield programs. Health Express does perform better in terms of passengers per hour than El Dorado transit’s Sac-Med service but as discussed above, the Sac-Med program is not as extensive.

**Table 15: WPCTSA Peer Transit Operator Analysis**

	Annual			Population Served (1)	Pax per Hour	Pax per Mile	Pax per Capita
	Ridership	Vehicle Hours	Vehicle Miles				
<i>My Rides</i>	6,971	--	129,150	353,847	--	0.05	0.020
<i>Health Express</i>	6,032	4,600	74,770	353,847	1.31	0.08	0.017
<i>Total</i>	13,003	--	203,920	353,847	--	0.06	0.037
El Dorado County SacMed	572	670	17,021	183,000	0.85	0.03	0.003
Ride On Transportation San Luis Obispo	174,000	65,601	1,952,439	281,400	2.65	0.09	0.618
North of the River CTSA, Bakersfield	42,217	22,548	355,646	367,555	1.87	0.12	0.115
Peer Average	72,263	29,606	775,035	277,318	1.79	0.08	0.245

Note 1: American Community Survey 2016 estimates

**TRIP Riverside Program**

The TRIP Riverside Volunteer Driver program has been providing rides for residents of Riverside County since 1993. The TRIP program has become a model for volunteer driver programs in other areas. In general, the TRIP model is different than most of the My Rides program in that passengers must recruit their own volunteer driver. This reduces administrative costs for the program. For FY 2014-15, 1,028 unique riders received 123,821 free one-way trips and 1.8 million miles of escorted transportation at an average cost per trip of \$6.29. The subsidy per passenger mile was \$0.43. Of six volunteer programs modelled after TRIP in California, Massachusetts and Michigan, the average cost per trip was \$5.52 but the average trip length was 10 miles.

**Transportation Network Companies (TNCs)**

Transportation Network Companies have been successful in many areas with filling some paratransit services needs for transit agencies at a reasonable cost. One example in the Bay Area is Silver Ride. Silver Ride is a “door through door” assisted ride service for seniors for a variety of trip purposes. The company has a cashless transactions and no tips policy so seniors

do not need to carry change. Drivers will come into the senior's home and assist the passenger with getting into the vehicle. TNCs provide flexibility and convenience; however Silver Ride does not have drivers outside of the Bay Area. As a point of comparison, Silver Ride charges \$50 per one-way trip within the City of San Francisco. This is less than the cost per one-way trip for Health Express in FY 2016-17 (\$78.42).

Additionally, as a CTSA is partially funded with FTA funds, TNC drivers would still be subject to drug and alcohol testing under FTA law. The only exception to this rule is in the case of a voucher program where the passenger has a choice as to which TNC or taxi company to use for the trip, as FTA feels this would be too difficult to administer drug and alcohol testing programs for multiple companies.

### **Other Non-Emergency Medical Transportation Examples**

Hospitals have developed many different strategies to address the issue of transportation to medical appointments beyond traditional public transit. Denver Health Medical Center entered into a partnership with Transportation Network Company (TNC), Lyft, to provide transportation to discharged patients and patients needing transportation to/from outpatient clinic appointments. Denver Health Center provided funding for 200 rides over the first three months at an average cost of \$7.40 per ride where trips were limited to 25 miles. Lessons learned from this program are that the hospital must designate a staff member to schedule the rides and ensure that the patient is connected with the Lyft driver. Otherwise, the passenger/patient may miss the ride.

Grace County Health and Hospital in Vermont realized that existing transportation programs with restrictions such as age and two days advance notice created transportation barriers to those with urgent medical needs. The hospital collaborated with a non-profit agency to provide rides with only one criteria, "Passengers must be physically or cognitively independent or travel with an assistant." At present, passenger data has not been recorded but the program appears to be successful.

### **Summary**

WPCTSA provides an important service for Western Placer County residents with difficulties using traditional public transit. Over the past few years, performance of Health Express has varied but remained relatively flat. Finding volunteers for the My Rides program has been a challenge. The peer review indicates that there is the potential to provide more trips through CTSA services, particularly if other non-TDA funding sources can be used.